

New York, N.Y.  
October 10, 1940.

Mr. Raymond E. Buck  
Trinity Life Building  
Fort Worth, Texas

Dear Raymond:

I have your note about the application of TWA to serve, among other Texas cities, the Cities of Fort Worth and Dallas, and you have informed me of your discussions concerning this matter with the Fort Worth Chamber of Commerce and other citizens of Fort Worth.

It is our belief that American Airlines, Inc. should not oppose the entry of TWA into Fort Worth, if the operation which they propose is really logical and, if you could be reasonably convinced that the establishment of such additional service would be good for the public and good for the community. We would be entirely willing to leave it to the good judgment of the citizens of Fort Worth to analyze thoroughly the proposal made by TWA and to decide, after such analysis, whether or not the citizens of Fort Worth should aid TWA in securing authorization for the service proposed.

In order to gain a clear conception of the route which is proposed by TWA, it is necessary that it be drawn on a map and I hope that in your consideration of our discussion about the matter you will take a couple of the strip maps of American and project thereon not only the route proposed by TWA between Amarillo and Houston, and Amarillo, Dallas and Fort Worth, but also two other routes which will later be discussed in this letter, one of them going through St. Louis to Tulsa, Oklahoma City and Amarillo and the other going from Memphis and Oklahoma City to Amarillo.

The route proposed by TWA goes from Amarillo, through Lubbock and Austin, to Houston. It is proposed also by TWA that it operate an "offshoot" line from Abilene to Fort Worth and Dallas.

To anyone in the transportation business, and especially to anyone familiar with the transportation requirements of West Texas, the utility of the line proposed by TWA is in many respects quite difficult to understand.

The only possible participation that Fort Worth can have in this proposed service is the service which is advocated between Dallas, Fort Worth, Abilene, Lubbock and Amarillo. Obviously, it would be foolish to expect any service from Fort Worth and

Dallas to Houston or to Austin via Abilene.

It can, of course, be advocated that the establishment of this route from Fort Worth to Abilene and Amarillo will permit connections at Amarillo with services operated to the west by TWA, but that really gives the proposed line no great utility for the same connections are either now made by the Braniff line going from Fort Worth through Wichita Falls to Amarillo or the schedules can be adjusted in a manner which will permit an even better connection than would be available if the line were operated by TWA through Abilene and Lubbock. Certainly it is usual to press the advantages of the shortest route and certainly the route between Fort Worth and Amarillo via Wichita Falls has greater comparable utility for people going from Fort Worth to Amarillo than would any other route which might be provided, including the rather circuitous route proposed by TWA.

The distance between Fort Worth and Abilene is not great enough and the potential saving in time by the use of air transportation is not sufficient to warrant the belief that there is going to be any great volume of air travel between Fort Worth and Abilene. Further, even if there should be a substantial increase, the air carrier now operating between Fort Worth and Abilene can adequately take care of the requirements of any additional service which might be predicated upon increased business. I think it would be obvious to nearly anyone who is familiar with the volume of potential air travel between Fort Worth and Abilene that there is not the necessity of two carriers to operate lines in that section of the territory for the purpose of affording facilities for local transportation.

Further, it would obviously be uneconomical to endeavor to develop any considerable flow of through traffic between Fort Worth and Amarillo by way of a route which operates between those two cities via Abilene and Lubbock for such a route would be unnecessarily circuitous and the need of the traveling public could be much more effectively served by the existing route between Fort Worth, Wichita Falls and Amarillo. If there should develop need for additional service between Fort Worth and Amarillo, certainly Braniff is the logical operator in the public interest to operate such additional services, for the route operated by Braniff is the shortest one available and it further has the utility of being in operation at the present time and I think that the fundamental policy of all Fort Worth business people would be to encourage the development of the business of people who are doing business in Fort Worth now rather than to encourage the development of a new enterprise which has perhaps even less utility than that now being conducted.

So what conclusion does that leave you with, with respect to the route between Dallas, Fort Worth, Abilene, Lubbock and Amarillo? It necessarily leaves you with the conclusion that through business between Fort Worth and Amarillo can best be served by Braniff, including in that category all through business which is being transported to Amarillo for the purpose of connecting with westbound flights of TWA. There is no reason for

advocating the operation of a longer route to do exactly the same thing, but in a less effective manner than is being accomplished now on a shorter route available for that purpose.

I think that we can conclude that there will not be a great volume of local business between Fort Worth and Abilene and that most of the increase in through business between Fort Worth and Amarillo will go via the shorter route, so that you are left with the conclusion that the only great utility that this new route offers to Fort Worth is the utility of having air transportation facilities available between Fort Worth and Lubbock.

Lubbock is a progressive and enterprising city and I think that all of us who are acquainted with West Texas would like to see air transportation service available between Fort Worth and Lubbock, but I wonder if there is sufficient volume of potential air business between Fort Worth and Lubbock to warrant the establishment of a new airline whose greatest utility to the citizens of Fort Worth would be the establishment of a local service between Fort Worth and Lubbock.

Further, you must take into consideration that there is not now available and there is, so far as I know, no present plan for the establishment of a Federal airway between Abilene, Lubbock and Amarillo. A Federal airway would have to be established and would have to be in operation before the same measure of dependable service would be possible over that route as would be possible over the direct route between Fort Worth, Wichita Falls and Amarillo.

Much has been made by TWA of the fact that the business of the air transport lines has been growing and they hold out, without very much visible proof, the hope that business on all lines will soon justify duplication of service. The figures show, however, that the majority of the increase in the air transport business in the last few years has been between cities of considerable population and between cities where air transportation showed a very considerable saving in time over the facilities afforded by other methods of transportation. I think it would be difficult for any of us to visualize such rapid increase in the air transport business that there should now be a duplication of air transport services between Fort Worth and Abilene and between Fort Worth and Amarillo. I believe that the companies now operating between those cities are adequately equipped to take care of the present volume of business and are adequately able to expand their facilities to take care of business increases in the future.

You cannot escape the conclusion that the new route proposed by TWA is intended basically and primarily for the purpose of service the territory between Houston and Amarillo and an examination of the map really might logically lead you to believe that the inclusion of Fort Worth and Dallas on the route was an afterthought. Certainly its primary intention cannot be to serve Fort Worth and Dallas, for the line proposed between Fort Worth and Amarillo is just too illogical to permit that conclusion. As you well know, all of the air transport services in the south-

western area going from Houston to Amarillo go through the Fort Worth gateway, which means in effect that now every passenger going by air from Houston to Amarillo goes through Fort Worth, both on his journey to Amarillo and on his return journey home.

If the line which TWA proposes is authorized, established and operated, certainly TWA will have every incentive to move every Houston passenger they can persuade to take the TWA line via Abilene to Amarillo rather than come up on Braniff through Fort Worth gateway to Amarillo. In that way you can see that the primary premise upon which the operation is proposed is to divert traffic from the Fort Worth gateway, between Fort Worth and Amarillo, and to take it through a new gateway at Amarillo instead. I do not see how anyone could construe that effect as being in the interest of Fort Worth.

After you look at the map for awhile, you begin to wonder how TWA would operate the services which they propose if they were given the opportunity of conducting the operation. I think that you would logically conclude that they would believe their "through" service to be the service between Amarillo and Houston and I think that you would find that "through" planes would be operated from Amarillo to Houston. That leaves you with the question of how the operation from Dallas and Fort Worth would be conducted. If we could assume that there would be enough business for the operation of one plane from Houston to Amarillo and sufficient business for the operation of another plane from Dallas, Fort Worth, Abilene and Lubbock to Amarillo, we might logically and up with the "through" operation from Dallas and Fort Worth to Amarillo although by a very circuitous route. On the other hand, if your analysis should leave you with the doubt that there would be sufficient business out of Dallas and Fort Worth to run a "through" plane to Amarillo, you would have to conclude that one of the lines would be operated as a "through" line and the other line as a "shuttle" line. Certainly it might be logical to believe that the plan of operation proposed by TWA would be the operation of a "through" ship from Amarillo to Houston and the operation of a "shuttle" ship from Dallas and Fort Worth with a connection at Abilene for Lubbock and Amarillo.

It would be easy enough to set up a lot of proposed schedules showing the intention to operate through planes from all of the terminal cities, but let us suppose that the volume of business between Dallas and Fort Worth, Abilene, Lubbock and Amarillo should not be sufficient to warrant that. Certainly TWA would probably not be criticized then if they should come around and say that the volume of business would permit only the operation of a connecting plane between Fort Worth and Abilene.

I do not pretend to be an authority upon the method which TWA proposes to use in its operation, but, after all, we

have been in the operation of airlines for quite awhile, and, frankly, I do not see how you could justify that the potential volume of business would warrant the operation of a through plane from Fort Worth to Amarillo and a through plane from Houston to Amarillo at the same time.

The air transport business is, as yet, a young business and it will be a very long while before this business is as old and has had as much experience as is now available in rail transportation. Certainly we would all be very foolish if we did not endeavor to the best of our ability to avoid in air transportation some of the fundamental mistakes which have been made in rail transportation. I think that all of us, the government, the communities, the people and the airlines, all have a joint obligation in that respect.

Certainly any student of rail transportation would conclude that one of the basic defects in the rail transportation system today is that the rail transportation has entirely too many illogical, unjustified, uneconomical and duplicated services. Rail transportation as a whole would be a great deal healthier if a great many of those duplicated services could be eliminated and I think, on the whole, if they were eliminated the rail lines would have the financial ability to render an even better service to the traveling public.

We say again that, so far as constructive effect is concerned, Fort Worth would be interested only in the proposed route as far as it operates between Fort Worth, Abilene, Lubbock and Amarillo. With respect to the other section of the route going from Houston to Amarillo, the net effect of that operation, so far as Fort Worth is concerned, would be simply to divert from the Fort Worth gateway traffic which is going through that gateway at this time.

Fort Worth has now the shortest route available to Amarillo, in the service operated by Braniff. It has also the shortest route available to Abilene in the service operated by American. The companies operating these two routes are financially sound, are doing business in Fort Worth, and should be considered as part of the Fort Worth community. Is it worth while, from the standpoint of the citizens of Fort Worth, to encourage the development of a new route by another company when the principal effect of the "through" route proposal would be to divert business from the Fort Worth gateway?

I do think that all of us should join in trying to secure some air service for Lubbock. American already has an application in for the purpose of serving Lubbock in an east and west direction and I feel sure that some way can be found to serve them from Fort Worth. As a matter of fact, if TWA should put in a through route from Amarillo to Houston via Abilene, there would be service available from Abilene to Fort Worth on American and from Abilene to Lubbock on TWA, and, with proper connections at Abilene, you would have a Fort Worth-Lubbock service. I do not, however, see how the citizens of Fort Worth can get too enthusiastic about the establishment of that service from Houston through Abilene to Amarillo.

I understand that TWA has been discussing with some of the citizens of Fort Worth the matter of our application to include

Memphis, Oklahoma City and Lubbock on our transcontinental route. While that matter has no real application to the question which we are discussing here, we have no hesitancy about discussing the matter and we are glad of the opportunity to do so.

You are aware of the fact that there has been pending for sometime an application on behalf of several carriers to operate a service between Memphis, Oklahoma City and Amarillo. I think that there is no doubt that TWA has been advocating the establishment of that service for quite sometime.

TWA has further filed an application seeking the opportunity of operating an airline between St. Louis, Tulsa, Oklahoma City and Amarillo.

Obviously, the intention of TWA in seeking to operate between St. Louis, Tulsa, Oklahoma City and Amarillo is at least in part to take passengers from St. Louis, Tulsa and Oklahoma City, now going through the Fort Worth gateway on American Airlines to the west, over their own route through connections at Amarillo. Certainly one of the primary intentions in seeking the operation of a route between Memphis, Oklahoma City and Amarillo would be to take people now going from Memphis and points east off our planes at Memphis and divert them through Oklahoma City for a connection with TWA at Amarillo.

American Airlines, Inc. has been operating in the Southwest for a great many years. We have grown up there, lived there, and have spent our money in the development of air transportation in that section. Our constructive intentions with respect to the people of the Southwest have been evidenced by what we have been able to do there over a period of a great many years. We have endeavored to develop air transportation there and will continue to do that.

Other people have applied for the route between Memphis and Amarillo and between St. Louis and Amarillo via Oklahoma City. It may be that such a route will be granted, for certainly there are a great many people and a great many communities desirous of such authorization. If there is a real need for such additional service and if that need can be proven, and if there is need for a new operation there, we would very much like for American to have the opportunity of conducting the new service, for it ~~is~~ is certainly in our territory. That being the case, we have applied for the opportunity of furnishing service between Memphis, Oklahoma City, Lubbock and the West by asking that these cities be included on our transcontinental route.

I think that any responsible business man of Fort Worth would consider the management of this company foolish indeed if it did not seek to have the opportunity of conducting all logical services in its territory, especially when a good many other companies who have not done any pioneering work in the territory are seeking that selfsame opportunity. Fort Worth is very desirous of protecting its position in the air transport industry and quite logically so. I think that American is equally desirous of maintaining its position by seeing that we get proper protection in the territory which we have developed and under such conditions a company cannot be criticized, when it says that if such routes are

to be operated, our company, being the pioneer, should have the opportunity of operating them.

TWA would like to raise the bugaboo of American diverting all of its services through Oklahoma City and abandoning the operation of services in the Fort Worth territory. In the first place, that is entirely illogical for the reason that our certificate of convenience and necessity requires that we give good and adequate service to Fort Worth, and, second, that it is our intention to do so anyway. After all, we have quite a substantial investment in Fort Worth and certainly I think we have a more intense interest in developing aviation in Fort Worth than some other people who have never spent any money or any time in that territory except in the pursuit of the opportunity of paralleling a line or group of lines which have been established and operating for quite sometime.

It seems to me that if TWA is endeavoring to enlist the support of Fort Worth citizens for the new line which they propose, it would be much better to create support for that proposal based upon constructive facts about what they propose to do for Fort Worth rather than predicating their own case on what American Airlines might intend to do in Memphis or Oklahoma City. I think the people of Fort Worth are better acquainted than that with what American would be willing to do for Fort Worth than what TWA would be willing to do.

So far as TWA is concerned, we do not advocate that the citizens of Fort Worth endorse or condemn their route. We advocate that the citizens of Fort Worth do whatever they think is best for the interests of Fort Worth and that I am sure they are adequately equipped to do and that I am sure they will do.

Sincerely,

Signed: C.R. Smith  
President

P.